

Allen County Engineer's Office

Quality Based Selection Process



Note: This policy is intended to keep the Allen County Engineer in compliance with Ohio's Design Professional Selection Law (Ohio Revised Code Sections 153.65 through 153.73).

When the need arises for professional design services, the Allen County Engineer will appoint a Consultant Selection Committee, which will follow this quality based selection policy to choose a professional design firm to perform the work.

I. Notification of Work

A. Professional Design Service Contracts estimated at \$49,999 or less

As per Ohio Revised Code [§153.71], professional design service contracts estimated at \$49,999 or less will not be announced. Instead, the Consultant Selection Committee shall award these contracts utilizing the Pre-qualified Consultant List [ORC §153.68] as detailed below. However on a project-by-project basis; the Allen County Engineer reserves the right to use the other methods as per [ORC §153.67], to announce the need for professional design services.

When using the Pre-qualified Consultant List, the Committee shall simply select the firm which is determined to be the most qualified to perform the work. Only those consultants who have a current and active pre-qualification status will be eligible for this selection. Once the firm has been selected, the Allen County Engineer shall move directly into **Contract Negotiations** with the selected firm as set forth under *Item III* below.

In order to obtain and maintain pre-qualified status and thus be eligible for selection, firms must annually submit, in person, updated general qualifications to the Allen County Engineer's Office. *These general qualifications are to be submitted between January 1st and January 31st of each calendar year. On February 1st of each year, our files will be updated and all general qualifications dated prior to January 1st of that same year will be discarded.* As other firms become aware of this policy, general qualification statements will be accepted at any time from any firm. It is the consultant's responsibility to maintain pre-qualified status; no advertisements or notifications will be made.

General Qualifications Requirements

As a minimum, the general qualification statement must contain the following information:

- a) A brief history and location of the firm
- b) Education, licensing and experience/expertise of current staff available for projects
- c) Examples of work, including types of projects completed in the past, with references
- d) Any previous work performed for the Allen County Engineer
- e) Current O.D.O.T. pre-qualification status
- f) Current O.D.O.T. Consultant Evaluation System (CES) scores
- g) Proof of liability insurance

Any statement of general qualifications that does not contain all of this information may be deemed not pre-qualified at the discretion of the Allen County Engineer.

All general qualifications must be submitted in person to the Allen County Engineer's Office and be a maximum of four (4) pages in length (not including Proof of Insurance).

For additional reference, standard company brochures may be submitted separately. These brochures must be bound and less than one-half (½) inch thick and fit into a legal size hanging file folder. No three-ring hard cover notebooks will be accepted.

B. Professional Design Service Contracts estimated at \$50,000 or more

For professional design services contracts estimated at \$50,000 or more, the Consultant Selection Committee will publicly announce the need for such services. Announcements can be made through any of the following that the Allen County Engineer considers to be appropriate: a professional association, the news media, or through any publications or other public media (including electronic media) [ORC §153.67].

These announcements will be made in a consistent manner and shall be made in advance to allow enough time for qualified professional design firms to submit a letter of interest. Announcements shall include the project information, the qualifications and services required along with any specific instructions for submitting the letter of interest. Submittals will be evaluated using **Consultant Selection**, as set forth under *Item II* below.

II. Consultant Selection

A. Evaluations

The Consultant Selection Committee shall review all letters of interest/statements of qualifications received for the specific project. The Selection Committee may also hold discussions with individual firms to further explore the firms' qualifications, services and various technical approaches that the firms may take.

Following these evaluations, the Consultant Selection Committee shall select and rank no fewer than three (3) firms, which it considers to be the most qualified to provide the required professional design services. If the Selection Committee determines (in writing) that fewer than three (3) qualified firms are available, the Selection Committee shall select and rank those firms.

B. Ranking Firms

On a project-by-project basis, the Consultant Selection Committee will evaluate the selected consultants based upon the "Consultant Evaluation Form", for which the Selection Committee will establish weights for each of the evaluation categories. The ratings of each category will be multiplied by the weights to get the scores, which will then be summed for a total score. Firms will be ranked from highest to the lowest total score with the highest scoring firm being the most qualified. In the case of a tie between two (2) firms, the tie will be broken as follows:

1. Preference will be given to the firm whose office is within Allen County. If more than two (2) firms are affected by the tie, one or more may be eliminated by this item even if a tie still remains between two (2) or more firms;
2. If Item (1.) above does not completely eliminate the tie, then the project engineer shall select the firm of his/her choice from those firms not eliminated by Item (1.) above.

Once firms have been ranked, the Allen County Engineer shall move directly into **Contract Negotiations** with the highest ranked firm as set forth under *Item III* below.

III. Contract Negotiations

Once the qualified firm has been selected, the firm will be asked to submit a price proposal for the professional design services required. The Allen County Engineer reserves the right to negotiate with the consultant for a better contract price. Once the engineer and the consultant come to an agreement as to the scope, fee and timeline, the Allen County Engineer will request the consultant to prepare a formal agreement. The Allen County Engineer will then send this agreement along with a recommendation to the Board of Allen County Commissioners for approval and for the execution of the contract.

If the engineer and the consultant can not come to an agreement as to the scope of work and fee associated with this work, the project engineer must then negotiate these services with the second most qualified firm. This procedure is repeated until an agreement is reached and the contract is awarded. Once the negotiations are complete, the Allen County Engineer shall notify all firms involved in technical proposal submission of the final selection.

IV. Exemptions

The Allen County Engineer may directly select consultants for projects that are exempt from the Quality Based Selection process. Exempt projects are as follows:

Any project determined (in writing) by the Allen County Engineer to be an emergency requiring immediate action including, but not limited to, any projects requiring multiple contracts let as part of a program requiring a large number of professional design firms of the same type.



Quality Based Selection Evaluation Form

Project _____

Design Firm _____

Evaluators _____

<u>Criteria</u>	<u>Rating*</u>	<u>Weight**</u>	<u>Score</u>
1. Firm & Individual Qualifications			
Firm's number of years in the business	_____ x	_____ =	_____
Firm's education/expertise of current/available staff	_____ x	_____ =	_____
Firm's experience with similar projects	_____ x	_____ =	_____
2. References			
Quality of design	_____ x	_____ =	_____
Controlling costs/meeting budgets	_____ x	_____ =	_____
Communication/cooperation	_____ x	_____ =	_____
3. Proximity to the Allen County Engineer's Office	_____ x	_____ =	_____
4. Past Performance w/ the Allen County Engineer	_____ x	_____ =	_____
5. Current ODOT Pre-qualification Status	_____ x	(5) =	_____
6. Current ODOT CES Score	_____ x	_____ =	_____
Total Score			=

Rating*

- | | |
|------------------|---------------|
| 0 = Unacceptable | 3 = Good |
| 1 = Poor | 4 = Excellent |
| 2 = Fair | 5 = Superior |

Weight**

(0-5) Weights vary for each criteria and also from project to project.

Firm's Number of Years in business

- | | | |
|------------------|---|----------|
| less than 1 year | = | 0 rating |
| 1 < years < 6 | = | 1 rating |
| 6 < years < 8 | = | 2 rating |
| 8 < years < 10 | = | 3 rating |
| 10 < years < 12 | = | 4 rating |
| 12 years or more | = | 5 rating |

Proximity to the Allen County Engineer's Office

- | | | |
|---------------------|---|----------|
| Within Allen County | = | 5 rating |
| Within 25 miles | = | 4 rating |
| Within 50 miles | = | 3 rating |
| Within 75 miles | = | 2 rating |
| Within 100 miles | = | 1 rating |
| Outside 101 miles | = | 0 rating |

Past Performance with this Public Agency

Consideration will be given to any previous problems encountered with a firm due to error in plans and/or completion of plans in a timely manner.

Technical Proposal Form

General Instructions

Each component below requires a thorough response. Where explanations are requested, they must be given in detail. Do not provide information which is not requested in this form. Please reply concisely.

I. Submitting Technical Proposal

- a) Proposals must contain a Transmittal Letter on your firm's letterhead signed by the contractual officer.
- b) Technical Proposal must meet the following requirements as outlined in "Specifications for Consulting Services".
 - 1) Provide a minimum of 1½" top margin on all sheets.
 - 2) Page number must be centered at the bottom of each page.
 - 3) Use bond weight paper only, including that used for dividers.
 - 4) Use 8½" x 11" paper only.
 - 5) All proposals must be top punched, for ACCO 2-hole fastening systems, center, 2 3/4" c/c holes.
 - 6) Bind proposals by stapling at the top upper left hand corner. DO NOT use any other binder system.
 - 7) DO NOT provide tabbed inserts or other features that may interfere with machine copying.
- c) Deliver one (1) original and two (2) copies to Allen County Engineer, 1501 N. Sugar Street, Lima, Ohio 45801.
- d) Proposals must be received at the above location on the due date on or before 3:00 p.m.

II. Technical Approach

Please explain your method for the project development. In addition, please explain any aspect of your method which is unique or innovative, and specify the economic benefits to Allen County if such an approach is utilized. Consider any impact on the efficiency and effectiveness of accomplishing the required work.

III. Key Personnel

Indicate key personnel, along with their work experience, who will be assigning the project. Include any specialist outside the consultant's firm who will be employed for the project.

- a) Project Manager
- b) Other Key Personnel

IV. Availability and Capacity

Discuss your staff's availability and capacity in the required skill classes necessary to accomplish the work outlined in your technical approach.

V. Subcontracts

List any items of work which are proposed to be subcontracted for this project.

VI. Project Advancement Schedule

Considering Allen County's proposed project completion date and the review time needed for the project development, provide and discuss your firm's schedule for the various elements of the work to meet the proposed completion date.